

Lesson Plan – Exploring Secularism

KS5 lesson 1 - What different types of secularism are there?

Background	<p>In this resource students explore and reflect on six different approaches to, or models of secularism identified by sociologist of religion and secularism, Jacques Berlinerblau, including their strengths and weaknesses. Students should read the information text on different types of secularism and the six types of secularism. This is to be followed by an exercise where students need to find out which type of secularism matches to a "positive view" and a "negative view". In the second part of the exercise students should reflect and discuss questions about strengths and weaknesses of each of the type.</p> <p>In the end, the teachers should share the correct answers for the matching exercise.</p>
Subjects	Politics Religion & Belief Education
Curriculum links	<p>AQA A Level Government and politics:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Key concepts and terminology:• <i>equality of opportunity, anti-discrimination</i> <p>AQA A Level Religious studies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Section A: Study of religion• <i>Religion and secularisation</i>• <i>Religion and religious pluralism.</i> <p>Eduqas Religious Studies A level -Theme 3: Significant social and historical developments in religious thought</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• <i>Historical developments in religious thought – challenges from secularisation: The conflicting religious and non-religious views on Christianity in the UK (the value of Christian faith schools; whether the UK can be called a ‘Christian country’); beliefs conflicting with laws of the country;</i>
Key Question	What different types of secularism are there?
Learning Outcomes	<p>Basic</p> <p>Students should demonstrate they can:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Compare and contrast a range of approaches to secularism.• Offer a viewpoint on the positives and negatives of different approaches to secularism, drawing on basic source material.

Lesson Plan – Exploring Secularism

KS5 lesson 1 - What different types of secularism are there?

	<p>Advanced</p> <p>In addition to the basic learning outcomes, students should demonstrate they can:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Offer their own viewpoints on the positives and negatives of different approaches to secularism, drawing on contemporary examples and outside knowledge.
Stimulus	<p>Stimulus 1. Information text on different types of secularism</p> <p>Secularism is an attempt at organising society so different religions and belief system can co-exist together. It is a pluralistic philosophy that wishes to maximise freedom of religion and freedom from religion. There are several types of secularism each with its own unique take on relationship between the religion and the state.</p> <p>“Secularism is a political philosophy, which, at its core, is preoccupied with, and often deeply suspicious of, any and all relations between government and religion. It translates that preoccupation into various strategies of governance, all of which seek to balance <i>two necessities</i>: (1) the individual’s need for freedom of, or freedom from, religion, and (2) a state’s need to maintain order.” – Prof. Jacques Berlinerblau, director of the Program for Jewish Civilization at Georgetown University.</p> <p>Stimulus 2: Berlinerblau’s six types</p> <p>a. Separationism</p> <p>Separationism is the idea that “Church” (religious institutions) and “State” (government and public institutions) should be separate institutions and not interfere in each other’s running and spheres of influence. Separationism can also be understood in a wider sense as the separation of religious and state interests and the idea that the state shouldn’t aid (via having an official state religion that would have privileged position in society) or restrict religion (by</p>

Lesson Plan – Exploring Secularism

KS5 lesson 1 - What different types of secularism are there?

allowing some religions to be recognised and not allow others based on theological views).

Necessity (1) freedom of/from religion: Separationism sees the state's involvement in religion as the principal driver of restrictions on religious freedom. It proposes that freedom from state control of religion (or vice versa) provides freedom for individuals to make their own religious choices.

Necessity (2) ordered liberty: Separationism sees the entanglement of religion with the affairs of the state as undermining the state's secular function. Separationism traditionally saw competition for control of the state as being a key driver of interreligious conflict. This model argues that where the state dictates religious matters, it imposes on the ordered liberty of individuals, and where religious matters impose on the state, it undermines the state's ability to maintain ordered liberty.

b. Disestablishmentarianism

Disestablishmentarianism is very similar in its concern over disentangling state and religious institutions, but usually it is specifically concerned with the disestablishment of formal state religions. For that reason, the positive/negative views and approaches to the two necessities are basically the same as for separationism. Where disestablishmentarianism differs from separationism is the additional concern and debate over what should belong to the state or the religion when religious institutions have been owned or funded by the state as part of establishment. For example, when the Anglican Church was disestablished in Wales, the Church in Wales was no longer able to directly tax the population. However, the properties which such taxes (tithes) helped fund were kept by the Church.

c. Laïcité

Laïcité is strongly associated with the French model of secularism which emerged alongside republicanism in

Lesson Plan – Exploring Secularism

KS5 lesson 1 - What different types of secularism are there?

reaction to abuses committed by religious and aristocratic authorities. It is best understood as the idea that there is a fiercely secular public realm, which needs to be enforced, to maintain separation from religion and religious conflict.

Necessity (1) freedom of/from religion: Laïcité heavily favours freedom from religion in the public sphere, relegating freedom of religion largely to the private sphere or personal practice.

Necessity (2) ordered liberty: Such systems are suspicious of overt religious manifestations that are seen as potential sources of conflict or competing authority. Laïcité sees participation in a particular form of secular citizenship as an important responsibility and basis of other rights.

d. Accommodationism

Background: All models of secularism are accommodationalist to an extent. But what is referred to as “Accommodationism” is the belief that religion is a public good that can be promoted by the state as long as it doesn’t unfairly privilege one religion over any others. In this view the state should respond to traditional conflicts caused by and between religions by making religious organisations partners in the delivery of services and the maintenance of order.

Necessity (1) freedom of/from religion: Such models generally prioritise freedom of religion over freedom from religion, and see such rights as more communal than individualist. Proponents of such models argue that they moderate the negative aspects of religion that citizens might need freedom from.

Necessity (2) ordered liberty: In such models, religious institutions and leaders are seen as key in maintaining order within their in-group, alongside rather than in competition with the state’s own maintenance of order.

Lesson Plan – Exploring Secularism

KS5 lesson 1 - What different types of secularism are there?

e. Non-cognisance

Background: This is the idea that the state doesn't take "cognisance" of religious concerns, but dons a "veil of ignorance" which blinds it to these. The state can recognise things like religious freedom and religious discrimination (where it has a secular interest in them) but aims to be neutral on (or blind to) theological issues.

Necessity (1) freedom of/from religion: In effect it aims to separate religion and state (and vice versa) while maintaining a state role in protecting freedom of and from religion. Because the state is non-cognisant of purely religious concerns it can't act on them or be used to impose on them.

Necessity (2) ordered liberty: This model restricts the state to maintaining rights and policies that can be articulated in a secular manner. This sees the scope of ordered liberty as being defined to those restrictions and protections that can be secularly justified.

f. State Sponsored Atheism

Background: Some states have adopted official policies of promoting atheism or outlawing religious practices or institutions. Most advocates of secularism do not consider this to be a form of secularism – particularly as such states have usually targeted religion to avoid rivalry with their own official dogma.

Necessity (1) freedom of/from religion: This form of secularism (if it can be considered one) is not generally concerned with freedom of religion, however it could be considered an extreme attempt to maintain freedom from religion. Some such states might make limited accommodations for religious freedom where it is not in conflict with state order.

Necessity (2) ordered liberty: This model prioritises collective order above other concerns. Such models usually have an

Lesson Plan – Exploring Secularism

KS5 lesson 1 - What different types of secularism are there?

	<p>extremely limited concept of ordered liberty, in which adherence to a specified worldview is seen as essential.</p>
Exercise	<p>Exercise 1</p> <p>In the next activity you should match the positives and the negatives of different type of secularism models. Write the correct type next to the paired positive and negative.</p> <p>View 1</p> <p>Positive view: The need to appeal for state support can moderate religions, leading to them being more managerial and service-oriented and less evangelical. With less of a need to compete for new converts, religions are freer to work together reducing religious upheavals. The state is able to harness religions’ potential for social good – alleviating a welfare burden on the state – while gaining influence over religious communities.</p> <p>Negative view: While reducing interreligious conflict, such policies can increase oppression within communities by setting religious community leaders up as gatekeepers. Such policies undermine the principle of equality before one unified law. Such policies do not well accommodate small religious communities and the religiously unaffiliated or nonreligious. Such policies can encourage politicians to appeal to religious blocs rather than individuals or cross-community initiatives.</p> <p>Your answer - Which type of secularism does this match with?</p> <p>View 2</p> <p>Positive view: In countries with this strong tradition, it is often an important part of national cultural identity and has often been successful in preventing internal religious conflicts. Such models have a strong focus on egalitarianism and a positive view of citizens as holders of rights and responsibilities.</p> <p>Negative view: Critics argue that this tradition leads to an obsession with religion and desire to legislate about religion that prioritises homogeneity over pluralism. Some argue that its emergence in such a specific cultural context leaves it inflexible and unable to respond to cultural changes.</p>

Lesson Plan – Exploring Secularism

KS5 lesson 1 - What different types of secularism are there?

Your answer - Which type of secularism does this match with?

View 3

Positive view: By separating religious and state institutions, you remove the ability of the state to interfere in religious practices and the ability of religious institutions to use the state to impose their practices or beliefs.

Negative view: Critics argue that religious and state institutions can have a positive relationship working together, and that if assured of dominance, larger state religions are more secure and able to advocate for minority religious rights. Others question why religious institutions specifically should be separated from the state and why states shouldn't reflect the religious makeup and concerns of their citizens. In addition, such models can be criticised for focusing too much on religious institutions at the expense of addressing other ways the use or misuse of religious power might undermine individuals' or society's freedom of and from religion.

Your answer - Which type of secularism does this match with?

Views 4

Positive view: This means that the state treats religious organisations and irreligious organisations equally. The state treats the secular concerns of all citizens, whether religious or not, equally.

Negative view: Because of traditional religious privilege and discrimination, the secular concerns of certain religious groups, leaders or organisations can end up being given more or less attention. Others might question why religious (or irreligious) concerns should be excluded from public policy making. Others question the legitimacy of differentiating between religious or secular concerns.

Your answer - Which type of secularism does this match with?

Lesson Plan – Exploring Secularism

KS5 lesson 1 - What different types of secularism are there?

View 5

Positive view: Religion has often been a source of disruption and conflict. States which mandate atheism might hope to escape such conflicts and create a more homogeneous nation with a unified worldview.

Negative view: Such states have tended to be extremely repressive and operate functionally similarly to theocracies. It is unreasonable to expect groups (particularly marginalised or minority groups) to abandon religious and closely related cultural practices and beliefs.

Your answer - Which type of secularism does this match with?

View 6

Positive view: By separating religious and state institutions, you remove the ability of the state to interfere in religious practices and the ability of religious institutions to use the state to impose their practices or beliefs.

Negative view: Critics argue that religious and state institutions can have a positive relationship working together, and that if assured of dominance, larger state religions are more secure and able to advocate for minority religious rights. Others question why religious institutions specifically should be separated from the state and why states shouldn't reflect the religious makeup and concerns of their citizens. In addition, such models can be criticised for focusing too much on religious institutions at the expense of addressing other ways the use or misuse of religious power might undermine individuals' or society's freedom of and from religion.

Your answer - Which type of secularism does this match with?

Exercise 2

Discuss questions:

Review Stimulus #1 (Two necessities) and invite general discussion of the first three questions:

Q1. What do you think of Berlinerblau's definition of secularism?

Q2. Is there anything Berlinerblau's definition misses out?

Lesson Plan – Exploring Secularism

KS5 lesson 1 - What different types of secularism are there?

	<p>Q3. What do you think of the terms for Berlinerblau’s six types of secularism? (a–f)?</p> <p>Review Stimulus #2 (The six types) and individually or in groups go through questions four to seven.</p> <p>Q4. What are the strengths and weaknesses of each type (a–f) of secularism?</p> <p>Q5. How does each type of secularism (a–f) approach Berlinerblau’s first of “two necessities”? – balancing freedom of and from religion.</p> <p>Q6. How does each type of secularism (a–f) approach Berlinerblau’s second of “two necessities”? – ordered liberty.</p> <p>Q7. Does the UK follow any of these models of secularism, or a synthesis of more than one?</p> <p>Answers for exercise 1:</p> <p>a. Separationism - View 3</p> <p>b. Disestablishmentarianism - View 6</p> <p>c. Laïcité - View 2</p> <p>d. Accommodationism - View 1</p> <p>e. Non-cognisance - View 4</p> <p>f. State Sponsored Atheism - View 5</p>
Take it Further	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Find an interview of Berlinerblau discussing the six types of secularism.• Find a critical and a positive review of Berlinerblau’s book <i>How to be Secular</i>, which discusses these models of secularism.• Divide a piece of paper into six rows and three columns. How does each of Berlinerblau’s six types of secularism affect religious privilege, tolerance and discrimination?
Link to KS4 Study	Theme 1 Core Principles (311) “What is Secularism” Theme 1 Core Principles (312) “Who is a Secularist?”